

1998 Proposal Solicitation Package Evaluation/Selection Process

Proposals were reviewed using a two-step process. First, seven Technical Review Panels (TRPs) made up of state, federal and non-agency representatives were formed to evaluate and score proposals submitted under each of the nine Topic sections. The TRP members list is attached.

The Integration Panel then evaluated recommendations from the TRPs checking for duplicate proposals, identifying any conflicts or synergy between TRP recommendations in the different topic areas, and identifying unmet restoration needs. They also were tasked with ensuring the overall integrity of the technical review process. An Integration Panel member list is attached.

Role of the Technical Review Panels (TRPs)

The role of the Technical Review Panels (TRPs) was to evaluate and score each of the proposals on its effectiveness and ability to achieve its stated goals. The panels used the criteria described in each Topic section to evaluate and score proposals. Scores for each of the criteria ranged from zero to twenty-five. A proposal needed to receive a total score of at least 40 out of a total possible score of 70 to be eligible for funding in this funding cycle. The TRPs also recommended which proposals should be funded if funding requests for eligible proposals exceeded the available funds budgeted. The TRPs evaluation of proposals was forwarded to the Integration Panel for their deliberation in proposing the recommended package of projects to be funded.

Timing/coordination for decisions

Integration Panel recommendations for funding were reviewed by the Ecosystem Roundtable on August 31; Management Team on September 1, and will be reviewed by the Bay-Delta Advisory Council on September 11. The CALFED member agencies, acting through the CALFED Policy Group, will make final funding recommendations to the implementing agencies. Final approval for funding proposals rests with the appropriate CALFED agency.

All funding recommendations will be coordinated with other appropriate funding sources (such as the Central Valley Project Improvement Act (CVPIA)), and programs administered through other agencies (such as the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and the State Water Resources Control Board (SWRCB)). Accordingly, the CALFED funding recommendations may identify co-funding or alternative funding options for projects. Proposals not funded through this PSP will be forwarded, as appropriate, to other funding sources for their consideration. Project funding provided through sources other than those listed in this PSP may include additional contract/award terms and conditions.

It is anticipated that funding decisions will be made by the end of September, 1998. Preparation of contracts or cooperative agreements will begin as soon as projects are approved.

Technical Review Panels

Below is the make up of the Technical Review Panels for the May 1998 Proposal Solicitation Package. The implementing agencies for each Topic section are noted in parentheses. Note that one review panel was used for the Fish Passage Assessment, Fish Passage and Related Screen Improvements, and Small Screen Evaluations - Alternatives and Biological Priorities topics.

Fish Passage Assessment/Fish Passage and Related Screen Improvements/Small Screen Evaluations - Alternatives and Biological Priorities (Bureau of Reclamation)

Craig Sarsfield - *Team Leader* - Bureau of Reclamation - hydraulic technician
Jim Buell - Metropolitan Water District
Brent Mefford - Bureau of Reclamation - hydraulic research engineer
Marianne Hallet - National Resource Conservation Service - water supply specialist
Bill O'Leary - Bureau of Reclamation

Floodplain Management and Habitat Restoration (Fish and Wildlife Service)

Mike Aceituno - *Team Leader* - Fish and Wildlife Service - fish and wildlife biologist
Alan Forkey - National Resource Conservation Service - wetland specialist
Rick Sitts - Metropolitan Water District - biologist
Peter Vorster - The Bay Institute - Hydrologist/geomorphologist
Randy Benthin - Department of Fish and Game
Dan Strait - Fish and Wildlife Service
Clark Frentzen - Army Corps of Engineers
Walt Hoyer - Metropolitan Water District

Sediment Management (CALFED)

Eric Larson - *Team Leader* - University of California at Davis - research scientist
George Heise - California Department of Fish and Game - hydraulic engineer
Matt Brown - Fish and Wildlife Service - Red Bluff
Earle Cummings - Department of Water Resources

Fish Harvest Management Tools (CALFED)

Chris Deweese - *Team Leader* - University of California at Davis - marine fisheries specialist
Rich Dixon - California Department of Fish and Game
Paul Spencer - National Marine Fisheries Service - Tiburon Lab
Dan Viele - National Marine Fisheries Service - Long Beach
Roger Thomas - Golden Gate Fishermen's Association
Joe Miyamoto - East Bay Municipal Utility District

September 8, 1998

Species Life History (CALFED)

Paul Ward - *Team Leader* - California Department of Fish and Game - Springrun chinook
Randy Bailey - Metropolitan Water District consultant
Ruth Olsen - US Fish and Wildlife Service
Ted Sommer - Department of Water Resources - fisheries biologist
Dennis McEwan - California Department of Fish and Game

Local Watershed Stewardship (US Environmental Protection Agency)

Sam Ziegler - *Team Leader* - US Environmental Protection Agency
Laurel Ames - Sierra Nevada Alliance
Catriona Black - Coordinated Resources Management Program
Dale Hoffman-Floerke - Department of Water Resources - San Joaquin River
John Lowrie - National Resource Conservation Service
Julie Tupper - US Forest Service
Rebecca Fawver - CALFED

Environmental Education (US Forest Service)

Julie Tupper - *Team Leader* - US Forest Service
Bruce Forman - California Department of Fish and Game - environmental education specialist
Kay Antunez - Department of Forestry and Fire Protection - Project Learning Tree coordinator
Valerie Holcomb - CALFED - public information specialist
Ann Westling - US Forest Service - Tahoe NF- environmental education coordinator

September 8, 1998